

Special Constitutional Appointments Committee
State Bar of Arizona

February 15, 2023
9:00 a.m. – 10:12 a.m.
ZOOM

Open Session Minutes

MEMBER ATTENDANCE:

V = present virtually; A = absent.

Ted Schmidt, Chair	V	Kimberly Miles	V
Casey Arellano	V	Jimmie Smith	V
Robyn Austin	V	Georgia Staton	V
John Moody, Vice Chair	V	Benjamin Taylor	V
Alexis Firehawk	V		

OTHER ATTENDEES:

Guests: Applicant Ryan Patterson

State Bar Staff: Carrie Sherman

Minutes taken by: Carrie Sherman

Called to Order by: Ted Schmidt, Chair

Time 9:01 a.m.

I. Call to the Public: Mr. Patterson, a candidate, was interested in the process.

II. Process and Procedures: Chairs of standing Bar committees have been treated similar to that of the president of the Board of Governors – they vote to break a tie (SBA bylaws). After discussion, Jimmie Smith moved, Alexis Firehawk seconded and the motion carried unanimously that the chair may vote on matters before the Committee.

Due to the large number of applicants, the Committee addressed voting procedures. After discussion, Jimmie Smith moved, Kim Miles seconded and the motion carried to allow each Committee member to cast up to five (5) votes for Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments applicants, no limit for Pima County Commission on Trial Court Appointments applicants and up to 10 votes for applicants for the Arizona Commission on Appellate Court Appointments. After further discussion, the Committee agreed that a Committee member may cast more than one vote for an applicant.

Pursuant to the Board of Governors’ directive, each applicant had been interviewed. All applications had been assigned out to Committee members and provided with the established set of questions.

III. Executive Session: The Committee went into Executive Session at 9:19 a.m. to discuss the qualifications of some of the candidates after having reviewed the written reports on the applicants previously circulated. The Committee returned to Open Session at 9:31 a.m.

IV. Arizona Commission on Appellate Court Appointments: There are two positions. Each Committee member cast up to 10 votes for their top candidates. Alexis Firehawk moved, John Moody seconded and the motion carried unanimously to submit the following constitutionally qualified candidates who received at least two (2) votes to the Board of Governors:

<u>APPLICANT</u>	<u>COUNTY</u>	<u>POLITICAL PARTY</u>
Mr. Daniel J. Adelman, Arizona Center for Law in the Public Interest	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Shar Bahmani, Sacks Tierney PA	Maricopa	Democrat
Hon. (ret.) David Derickson, David G. Derickson PLLC	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Louis Diesel, Aspey Watkins & Diesel PLLC	Coconino	Democrat
Mr. E. Scott Dosek, Dosek Law Firm PLLC	Maricopa	Independent
Ms. Adriana Genco, Maricopa County Attorney's Office	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Bradley Jardine, Jardine Baker Hickman & Houston PLLC	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Patrick McGroder, Beus Gilbert McGroder PLLC	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Ryan Patterson, Thorpe Shwer PC	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Dianne Post, Attorney at Law	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. James Rappaport, Pima County Attorney's Office	Pima	Democrat
Ms. Carrie Rednour, Rednour Law Offices PLLC	Pima	Democrat
Hon. (ret.) Ronald Reinstein, Supreme Court of Arizona	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. Michael Sillyman, Attorney at Law	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Mary Ellen Simonson, Lewis Roca Rothgerber Christie LLP	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Karen Singer Smith, Arizona Justice Project	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Patrick Tighe, Snell & Wilmer LLP	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Lonnie Williams, Stinson LLP	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Charles Wirken, Gust Rosenfeld PLC	Maricopa	Democrat
<u>Constitutionally qualified but received 1 or no votes:</u>		
Mr. Kurt Altman, Kurt M. Altman PLC	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Michael Alvarez, Barreda Law PLLC	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Steven Berger, Engelman Berger PC	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Robert Carey, Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP	Maricopa	Republican
Ms. Anne Chapman, Mitchell SteinCarey Chapman PC	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Heyleigh Crawford, Osborn Maledon PA	Maricopa	Independent
Alexis Danneman, Perkins Coie LLP	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Jordan Ellel, Attorney at Law	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Steven Everts, Udall Shumway	Maricopa	Republican
Ms. JoAnn Falgout, Guidant Law Firm	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Karen Hartman-Tellez, Maricopa County Attorney's Office	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Nicole Hinderaker, Hinderaker Family Law	Pima	Independent
Mr. Taylor House, Scottsdale Family Law PLLC	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Loren Molever, Attorney at Law	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. Aaron Moskowitz, Maricopa County Public Defender's Office	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. Armando Nava, The Nava Law Firm PLLC	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Joel Nomkin, Perkins Coie LLP	Maricopa	Democrat

APPLICANT

COUNTY

POLITICAL PARTY

Constitutionally qualified but received 1 or no votes: (continued)

Ms. Elaine O’Hara, Attorney at Law	Pima	Democrat
Mr. Robert Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA	Maricopa	Democrat
Ms. Tiffani Lucero Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA	Maricopa	Democrat
Mr. Bradley Pew, Fennemore Craig PC	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Isaac Rothschild, Mesch Clark & Rothschild PC	Pima	Democrat
Ms. Emily Ward, Fennemore Craig PC	Maricopa	Independent
Mr. Michael Williams, Liberty Mutual	Maricopa	Republican
Mr. Paul Willman, Willman Law Firm	Pima	Democrat

V. Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 3:

The Committee learned that candidate Tyrell Taber had withdrawn his application. Each Committee member then cast up to five votes for their top candidates. John Moody moved, Jimmie Smith seconded and the motion carried unanimously to submit the following constitutionally qualified candidates to the Board who received at least two (2) votes:

APPLICANT

POLITICAL PARTY

Mr. Kurt Altman, Kurt M. Altman PLC	Republican
Mr. Shar Bahmani, Sacks Tierney PA	Democrat
Ms. Heather Baker-Mushkatel, Mushkatel Robbins & Becker PLLC	Democrat
Ms. Heyleigh Crawford, Osborn Maledon PA	Independent
Hon. (ret.) David Derickson, David G. Derickson PLLC	Republican
Mr. E. Scott Dosek, Dosek Law Firm PLLC	Independent
Mr. Robert Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA	Democrat
Ms. Tiffani Lucero Pastor, Montoya Lucero & Pastor PA	Democrat
Mr. Ryan Patterson, Thorpe Shwer PC	Democrat
Mr. Robert Shely, Law Office of Robert W. Shely	Democrat
Mr. Javier Torres, Stinson LLP	Democrat

Constitutionally qualified but received 1 vote:

Mr. Michael Alvarez, Barreda Law, PLLC	Democrat
Ms. Anne Chapman, Mitchell Stein Carey Chapman PC	Democrat
Ms. Adriana Genco, Maricopa County Attorney’s Office	Republican
Ms. Nicole Goodwin, Greenberg Traurig LLP	Democrat
Ms. Karen Hartman-Tellez, Maricopa County Attorney’s Office	Democrat
Ms. Jodi Jerich, Valley Schools Management Group	Republican
Mr. Armando Nava, The Nava Law Firm PLLC	Democrat

Benjamin Taylor offered a friendly amendment to add applicant Armando Nava to the list being submitted to the Board of Governors. The amendment died for the lack of a second.

VI. Maricopa County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 5:

As there were four (4) applicants, the Committee agreed to up to three votes for their top candidates. The Committee unanimously agreed recommend the following constitutionally qualified candidates to the Board of Governors as ranked:

APPLICANT

Ms. Brenda Munoz Furnish, William E. Morris Institute for Justice	8 votes	<u>POLITICAL PARTY</u> Democrat
Mr. Patrick Tighe, Snell & Wilmer LLP	5 votes	Democrat
Ms. Dianne Post, Attorney at Law	2 votes	Democrat

Constitutionally qualified but received no votes:

Mr. Jordan Ellel, Attorney at Law	Democrat
-----------------------------------	----------

VII. Pima County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial District 1:

There were seven (7) applicants and all were deemed constitutionally qualified. After discussion, John Moody moved, Kim Miles seconded and the motion carried unanimously to submit the entire list of candidates to the Board of Governors:

APPLICANT

Ms. Amy Hernandez, Amy Hernandez Law PLLC	<u>POLITICAL PARTY</u> Independent
Mr. Joseph Kroeger, Snell & Wilmer LLP	Independent
Ms. Frances T. Lynch, Bache & Lynch	Democrat
Mr. James Rappaport, Pima County Attorney’s Office	Democrat
Ms. Carrie Rednour, Rednour Law Offices PLLC	Democrat
Mr. John C. Smith, Gerald K. Smith and John C. Smith Law Offices, PLLC	Democrat
Mr. Paul Willman, Willman Law Firm	Democrat

VIII. Ongoing Recruitment

Recruitment efforts will continue for:

- Pima County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial Districts 2, 3 and 5
- Pinal County Commission on Trial Court Appointments – Supervisorial Districts 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5

IX. Adjournment: A motion was made, seconded and carried unanimously to adjourn the meeting at 10:12 a.m.